QGIS Application - Feature request #3201
Attribute table editor shouldn't allow columns named 'shape'

2010-11-12 05:04 AM - pinghanling -

Status:	Closed		
Priority:	Low		
Assignee:			
Category:	GUI		
Pull Request or Patch supplied:	No	**Resolution:**	
Easy fix?:	No	**Copied to github as #:**	13261

Description

QGIS allowed me to create an attribute column in a shapefile called 'Shape', which mysteriously disappeared.

When opening the file in [[ArcGIS]], I saw that such a column exists in all shapefiles to display the type of entity - point, line or polygon.

I think it would be better if the GUI disallowed attributes with the name 'shape' and displayed a window to explain why.

Associated revisions

Revision 4629900e - 2011-12-28 12:07 PM - Alexander Bruy

show warning when user tried to create field 'shape' in shapefile (fix #3201)

Revision d8f5b8d0 - 2011-12-28 12:09 PM - Alexander Bruy

show warning when user tried to create field 'shape' in shapefile (fix #3201)

History

#1 - 2011-12-16 01:54 PM - Giovanni Manghi

- Target version changed from Version 1.7.0 to Version 1.7.4

#2 - 2011-12-28 03:15 AM - Alexander Bruy

- % Done changed from 0 to 100

- Status changed from Open to Closed

Fixed in changeset commit:"4629900e77091d01f09f473b60c78685a5939b6c".

#3 - 2012-01-08 05:49 PM - Alister Hood

- Assignee deleted (nobody -)

- Pull Request or Patch supplied set to No

I don't think this is the correct fix. I can create a Memory layer with a field called "shape", then "Save as" to a shape file. When I load the file it still has the field named "shape". The file can also be opened by other software successfully (and the field is visible).

Shall I create a new ticket? I can't reopen this one...

#4 - 2012-01-08 05:52 PM - Alister Hood

Interesting - it used to be possible to add more than one field with the same name (not "shape"), but it isn't anymore ("The attribute could not be added to the layer").

#5 - 2012-01-09 03:21 AM - Jürgen Fischer

Alister Hood wrote:

> *I don't think this is the correct fix. I can create a Memory layer with a field called "shape", then "Save as" to a shape file. When I load the file it still has the field named "shape". The file can also be opened by other software successfully (and the field is visible).*

Apparently you can also open the shape in ArcGIS. It probably just hides the shape attribute as it uses that name to represent the features' virtual geometry "attribute". AFAICS not even the ESRI shapefile spec forbids the use of that attribute name. So I guess that warning is probably enough - and just what the submitter suggested.

#6 - 2012-01-09 03:24 AM - Jürgen Fischer

Alister Hood wrote:

> *Interesting - it used to be possible to add more than one field with the same name (not "shape"), but it isn't anymore ("The attribute could not be added to the layer").*

Since commit:f6e507c36a9d1b8644b6edb91f680138560a4640 you shouldn't be able to add a column name that already, when create a new shapefile.