

QGIS Application - Feature request #297
labels are misplaced

2006-09-22 03:41 PM - Redmine Admin

Status:	Closed	Resolution: duplicate Copied to github as #: 10356
Priority:	Low	
Assignee:	Martin Dobias	
Category:	Map Canvas	
Pull Request or Patch supplied:		
Easy fix?:	No	
Description		
<p>See the screendump. There are labels 1246, 799 and 1205 in the center. Can you see them? Good.</p> <p>The problem is that 1246 belongs to the selected, yellow-highlighted polygon, 799 to the greyish polygon and 1205 to the greenish one. But the way they are displayed, you wouldn't guess that they are. Zooming or playing with label positioning doesn't fix the problem. The 1246 is worst.</p> <p>This is not a separated case - it is a common bug when displaying narrow, long polygons.</p> <p>Maciek</p>		

History

#1 - 2006-09-22 04:57 PM - Gavin Macaulay -

Qgis currently displays polygon and linestring labels at the position given by the mean of the points that define the polygon or linestring. Label 1246 looks to be in the appropriate place under that scheme.

More intelligent placing of labels is something that we are planning for later releases of qgis. In the meantime, it is possible to use the 'Data defined position' abilities of the label dialog box to use data in your data source to place labels.

See ticket #54 for some other wishes to do with labels.

#2 - 2006-09-23 01:25 AM - Redmine Admin

Maybe I don't get something, but the way I understand what you are saying means that the 1246 should be somewhere within the the polygon it belongs to, ie. the yellow-highlited one? But it's not, as yuo can see - it's way under that polygon. This is the main problem.

Maciek

#3 - 2006-09-23 01:33 AM - Gavin Macaulay -

An example - if you have a polygon that is similar to your highlighted one where it is a u shape. The mean of all of the points that make up the polygon will be somewhere in the middle of the u, and not necessarily inside the polygon boundaries.

#4 - 2006-09-23 01:50 AM - Redmine Admin

Thanks, now I get it.

In that case, I consider it a serious defect than convex shapes are labelled wrong "by design". I find it strange it's not planned to be fixed for 0.8 and that you consider it an "enhancement".

Maciek

#5 - 2006-10-10 09:21 PM - anonymous -

In OGC terms, it should be used `[[PointOnSurface]]` instead of Centroid.

#6 - 2007-07-21 09:48 PM - Tim Sutton

Replying to [comment:4 tutey@o2.pl]:

Thanks, now I get it.

In that case, I consider it a serious defect than convex shapes are labelled wrong "by design". I find it strange it's not planned to be fixed for 0.8 and that you consider it an "enhancement".

Maciek

Hi

We can only plan work if there is someone willing, available and able to do the work. Martn Dobias is planning to redo the labelling implementation at some stage, and until that time we only offer the simple centroid based labelling as currently available in QGIS. For 0.9 we will still have the current labelling implementation so I am shifting this bug report over to 1.0. I'm leaving its status as 'Major' though since I do agree that it's something we should try to resolve before the final QGIS Stable Version 1.0 release

Regards

Tim

#7 - 2007-12-10 01:39 PM - Jürgen Fischer

fix in attached patch. Use GEOS's `getInteriorPoint` to determine label points. This is a configurable option as it has a large performance impact.

#8 - 2008-09-05 01:12 AM - Maciej Sieczka -

Could the patch by Jurgen be applied for 1.0?

#9 - 2009-05-04 03:04 AM - hamish -

Hi,

just to note that the project "Label placement for Quantum GIS" by Martin Dobias has been accepted for the 2009 Google Summer of Code.

see <http://www.osgeo.org/node/895>

Hamish

#10 - 2009-07-10 08:52 AM - Paolo Cavallini

See also #54, of which this is essentially a duplicate

#11 - 2009-08-31 11:53 PM - luca76 -

- Resolution set to duplicate
- Status changed from Open to Closed

closing, duplicate

Files

labels_bad.png	53.9 KB	2006-09-22	Redmine Admin
bug297fix.diff	6.55 KB	2007-12-10	Jürgen Fischer