QGIS Application - Bug report #2733
fTools Add geometry column fails to add XCOORD if source is GPX file or PostGIS Layer

2010-05-19 02:27 AM - marisn -

Status:	Closed		
Priority:	Low		
Assignee:			
Category:	Processing/QGIS		
Affected QGIS version:	master	**Regression?:**	
Operating System:		**Easy fix?:**	
Pull Request or Patch supplied:	Yes	**Resolution:**	
Crashes QGIS or corrupts data:	No	**Copied to github as #:**	12793

Description

Plugins -> GPS -> GPS tools -> load waypoint GPX file -> fTools -> Geometry tools -> Export/add geometry column -> Choose GPX waypoint layer -> Choose any output name -> OK -> Open attribute table: only YCOORD is present, XCOORD is missing.

Saving GPX as shapefile and then running fTools add geometry column works just fine for WGS84 and projected files.

QGIS 1.4.0 and trunk r13529
fTools 0.5.10

Associated revisions

Revision 1341a553 - 2012-05-29 06:36 PM - Salvatore Larosa

fix #2733

Revision f97b043e - 2012-05-29 07:26 PM - Alexander Bruy

Merge pull request #154 from slarosa/master

fix #2733

History

#1 - 2010-05-27 03:55 PM - Giovanni Manghi

Hi,

I noticed that if you open the GPX file trough the standard "add vector" interface things are pretty different: the attribute table is different and the "Export/add geometry column" works fine. So it should not be a ftools problem after all, but a problem of QGIS GPS tools toolbox.

#2 - 2010-06-14 04:46 AM - Giovanni Manghi

this should not be a ftools problem. Please leave further feedback and change the summary if you confirm my observations.

#3 - 2010-12-17 02:14 AM - Horst Düster

I found the same behaviour with [[PostGIS]] layers as well. The bug depends on the position of the geometry column in the column-list.

With the following POINT table-definition, geometry column at the beginning of the columns list:

```
CREATE TABLE test1
(
  id serial NOT NULL,
  wkb_geometry geometry,
  feld1 text,
  feld2 text,
  feld3 integer,
  CONSTRAINT test1_pkey PRIMARY KEY (id)
)
```

only the YCOORD column will be exported.

With the following POINT table-definition, with geometry at the end of the columns list:

```
CREATE TABLE test1
(
  id serial NOT NULL,
  feld1 text,
  feld2 text,
  feld3 integer,
  wkb_geometry geometry
  CONSTRAINT test1_pkey PRIMARY KEY (id)
)
```

all columns XCOORD and YCOORD will be exported fine.

#4 - 2011-10-15 05:35 AM - Giovanni Manghi

- Pull Request or Patch supplied set to No

- Status changed from Open to Feedback

- Target version deleted (Version 1.7.0)

Horst Düster wrote:

> *I found the same behaviour with [[PostGIS]] layers as well. The bug depends on the position of the geometry column in the column-list.*
>
> *With the following POINT table-definition, geometry column at the beginning of the columns list:*
>
> *[...]*
>
> *only the YCOORD column will be exported.*
>
> *With the following POINT table-definition, with geometry at the end of the columns list:*
>
> *[...]*
>
> *all columns XCOORD and YCOORD will be exported fine.*

Hi, I just tested with a PostGIS point table like

CREATE TABLE topo_c
(
  gid serial NOT NULL,
  "DESIGNACAO" character varying(28),
  "CODNUTS" character varying(12),
  "DTCC" integer,
  "DT" integer,
  "DISTRITO" character varying(25),
  "AGRUPC" character varying(25),
  "NUTSII" character varying(4),
  "NUSTIII" character varying(5),
  "REGIAO" character varying(30),
  "INC" integer,
  "POP" integer,
  pop10 integer,
  the_geom geometry
)

and it worked fine (with both ftools and the field calculator). I'm using qgis-trunk under Ubuntu. Please check again and leave feedback.

#5 - 2011-10-15 06:00 AM - Giovanni Manghi

- Operating System deleted (All)

- Must fix deleted (Yes)

Horst Düster wrote:

> *I found the same behaviour with [[PostGIS]] layers as well. The bug depends on the position of the geometry column in the column-list.*
>
> *With the following POINT table-definition, geometry column at the beginning of the columns list:*
>
> *[...]*
>
> *only the YCOORD column will be exported.*
>
> *With the following POINT table-definition, with geometry at the end of the columns list:*
>
> *[...]*
>
> *all columns XCOORD and YCOORD will be exported fine.*

You are right, if the geometry column is not at the end of the table, then FTOOLS just compute the YCOORD field. On the other hand computing the coordinates with the field calculator works ok. So after all it may be very well a Ftools issue (or not, maybe is a GEOS one. Carson, can you leave feedback?).

I'll remove the "must fix: yes" because we can use the field calculator instead as workaround.

#6 - 2011-12-16 02:12 PM - Giovanni Manghi

- Target version set to Version 1.7.4

#7 - 2012-04-16 06:24 AM - Paolo Cavallini

- Affected QGIS version set to master

- Crashes QGIS or corrupts data set to No

- Target version changed from Version 1.7.4 to Version 1.8.0

#8 - 2012-05-28 01:24 AM - Salvatore Larosa

- Assignee deleted (cfarmer -)

- Status info deleted (0)

Anyone can confirms?

In my case with sample data of the comment n.3, both columns (XCOORD and YCOORD) are not esported!

#9 - 2012-05-28 07:28 AM - Giovanni Manghi

Salvatore Larosa wrote:

> *Anyone can confirms?*
>
> *In my case with sample data of the comment n.3, both columns (XCOORD and YCOORD) are not esported!*

I still can confirm the behaviour described in #2733-3. now I will test with gpx files.

#10 - 2012-05-28 07:32 AM - Giovanni Manghi

Salvatore Larosa wrote:

> *Anyone can confirms?*
>
> *In my case with sample data of the comment n.3, both columns (XCOORD and YCOORD) are not esported!*

and I confirm also the behaviour described in the original ticket description and #2733-1

#11 - 2012-05-28 02:16 PM - Salvatore Larosa

Right now, the problems are two:
ext/add geometry tool does not work:

1) with data from database (not sure for Spatialite)
2) if the position of the field geometry is intermediate to the other, not at the end of the list.

In fact, dataProvider().fields().keys() returns [0, 2, 3] if the table is defined as follows:

    CREATE TABLE test (
    id serial NOT NULL < ----------------- 0

```
        geom geometry <---------------------- 1
        name text <------------------------ 2
        descr text <------------------------ 3
        CONSTRAINT test_pkey PRIMARY KEY (id)
        )
```

skipping a key, geom one!

well, I succeeded in solving this and I'll do a pull request after doing some more tests!

XCOORD and YCOORD work fine, I still have to test for linear and polygonal geometries!

Can anyone send me a GPX data to test it?

"... I forgot a thing very curious ....

extract/add geometry tool works even if the attribute table is open! (ref. #5335)"

#12 - 2012-05-29 06:49 AM - Giovanni Manghi

> *1) with data from database (not sure for Spatialite)*

it works

#13 - 2012-05-29 06:52 AM - Giovanni Manghi

- File wpt.gpx added

> *Can anyone send me a GPX data to test it?*

attached

#14 - 2012-05-29 09:48 AM - Salvatore Larosa

- Pull Request or Patch supplied changed from No to Yes

Thanks Giovanni!

here the patch

#15 - 2012-05-29 10:26 AM - Alexander Bruy

- Status changed from Feedback to Closed

Fixed in changeset commit:"f97b043e701cc466e35b2feddf02b791c26f67fe".

#16 - 2017-05-01 01:23 AM - Giovanni Manghi

The "ftools" category is being removed from the tracker, changing the category of this ticket to "Processing/QGIS" to not leave the category orphaned.

Files

wpt.gpx	87 KB	2012-05-29	Giovanni Manghi