QGIS Application - Bug report #21451 Quantile (Equal Count) on given dataset generates a lot of zero-classes

2019-03-03 11:27 AM - Richard Duivenvoorde

Status:	Feedback						
Priority:	Normal						
Assignee:							
Category:	Symbology						
Affected QGIS version:3.7(master)		Regression?:	No				
Operating System:			Easy fix?:	No			
Pull Request or Patch supplied:		Resolution:					
Crashes QGIS or corru ptis data:		Copied to github as #: 29268					
Description							
QuantileEqualCount2.png Adding more classes also adds more 'zero'- classes.							
Maybe it has something to do with the amount of zero in the values?							
Or with the negative values in it?							
Or is there some logarithmic logic in it (where there should be no negative values)?							
I've also tested with QGIS 2.18 and that gave the same results.							

History

#1 - 2019-03-03 11:38 PM - Nyall Dawson

- Status changed from Open to Feedback

I don't think this is a bug -- looking at your data distribution, it's impossible to partition into 10 equal sized groups.

#2 - 2019-03-04 08:54 AM - Richard Duivenvoorde

@nyall: agreed.

Will leave it open for now, to ask a R-adept to see what R does in cases like this: take the 'same' buckets together, or create more buckets but arrange the values over it.

#3 - 2019-03-04 10:50 AM - Pedro Venâncio

Hi Richard,

This is the correct result.

The R output is:

> table_random <- read.csv("\\random.csv")

#4 - 2019-03-04 11:04 AM - Richard Duivenvoorde

Hi Pedro,

Cool thanks! This is about creating the breaks isnt it? So QGIS does exactly the same. But how does R divide the values then over the buckets? As you see in the QGIS screenie all values are put in the first 'zero'-bucket. OR is this just a 'dumb' question, as you should just not use this method for such data.

#5 - 2019-03-04 12:06 PM - Pedro Venâncio

- File random_abs_freq.ods added

Hi Richard,

There are several forms to calculate quantiles. R implements, by default, the types described here:

https://www.rdocumentation.org/packages/stats/versions/3.5.2/topics/quantile

The "problem" with your dataset is that the value "0" (zero) is repeated much more (2605 of 5408) than any other value.

Basically what quantile does is split the sample in n parts, in such a form that any part has the same amount of values. For instance, if you divide in 5 parts, each part should became with 20% of the sample (in your case, points).

The easiest way to check the percentiles/quantiles in a spreadsheet is to calculate the absolute frequency, then the relative frequency, and then the cumulative relative frequency. After you have this, you just check the breaks, finding the value that match the cumulated relative frequency you are looking for (the percentile). Please see the spreadsheet attached with your data. For instance, the value that corresponds to cumulated relative frequency 0 is -27 (minimum); 0.5 is 4; 0.6 is 63; and so on. But as 0 has a relative frequency of more than 0.48, it includes the percentile 0.1, 0.2, 0.3 and 0.4.

So, with this distribution of data, or you reduce the number of classes used by quantile, or it is better to use another method.

Files			
random.gpkg	628 KB	2019-03-03	Richard Duivenvoorde
QuantileEqualCount2.png	81.4 KB	2019-03-03	Richard Duivenvoorde
random_abs_freq.ods	49.9 KB	2019-03-04	Pedro Venâncio