QGIS Application - Bug report #21275
manually selected datum transformation setting is ignored

2019-02-14 04:36 PM - Jonas Hurst

Status:	Closed		
Priority:	High		
Assignee:	Nyall Dawson		
Category:	Projection Support		
Affected QGIS version:	3.5(master)	**Regression?:**	Yes
Operating System:	Windows 10	**Easy fix?:**	No
Pull Request or Patch supplied:	No	**Resolution:**	
Crashes QGIS or corrupts data:	No	**Copied to github as #:**	29093

Description

affected version:
occured with 3.4.2
QGIS installed through OSGeo4W

precondition:
make sure, osgeo4w/share/proj folder contains transformation grid (in my case BETA2007)

reproduce:
1) Settings > Options > CRS > "Ask for datum transformation if several are available"=checked
2) load geodata (in my case a shapefile, GK zone 3, EPSG:31467)
3) Right-click legend layer in legend > Export > Save features as
4) enter file name and **select a different CRS** (in my case UTM zone 32N, EPSG: 25832)
5) click "OK" -> New window "select datum transformation" opens
6) choose one of these datum transformation options (in my case BETA2007)
  INFO: BETA2007 is not a paramter transformation but a grid-based transformation
7) click "OK"

expected result:
shapefile is transformed using BETA2007-grid

actual result:
QGIS ignores the selection for BETA2007 and uses some other parameter transformation (the default transformation?).
The same happens when using transformation grid BWTA2017: Both results are identical.
Transformations with grids are much more accurate!

hints:
transformation worked correctly in 2.18.26

attachment:
-shapefile in EPSG:31467 to be transformed into EPSG:25832 (original.shp)
-shapefile transformed wrong (transform_wrong.shp from QGIS 3.4.2)
-shapefile transformed correctly (transform_correct.shp from QGIS 2.18.26)
(Note the difference between the two of about 1.70m!)

why is this important?
Germany is in the process of changing it's national grid from Gauss-Kruger to UTM coordinates.
For this, the governments **requires** BETA2007 to be used (in some cases BWTA2017)

Associated revisions

Revision 41a72664 - 2019-03-12 05:39 AM - Nyall Dawson

Fix vector layer export transform selection choice is ignored

Fixes #21275

Revision d1910f59 - 2019-03-19 12:49 AM - Nyall Dawson

Fix vector layer export transform selection choice is ignored

Fixes #21275

Revision 76714194 - 2019-03-19 01:19 AM - Nyall Dawson

Fix vector layer export transform selection choice is ignored

Fixes #21275

History

#1 - 2019-02-15 01:58 PM - Alessandro Pasotti

- Category changed from Processing/QGIS to Vectors

- Status changed from Open to Feedback

I've tested current master on Linux and I couldn't reproduce the issue.

Can you please test (on windows) the latest nightly build to check if the issue is still present on master?

#2 - 2019-02-18 08:51 AM - Jonas Hurst

thank you for you quick feedback on this issue.

I am still able to reproduce this in todays nightly on win10 (delivered through osgeo).

#3 - 2019-02-18 02:18 PM - Giovanni Manghi

- Affected QGIS version changed from 3.4.2 to 3.5(master)

- Regression? changed from No to Yes

- Status changed from Feedback to Open

- Category changed from Vectors to Projection Support

#4 - 2019-03-05 09:39 PM - Andy Harfoot

As a workaround, if you define the desired transformation in the project CRS tab it appears to be honored when exporting

#5 - 2019-03-12 05:36 AM - Nyall Dawson

- Assignee set to Nyall Dawson

- Status changed from Open to In Progress

#6 - 2019-03-19 12:49 AM - Nyall Dawson

- Status changed from In Progress to Closed

- % Done changed from 0 to 100

Applied in changeset commit:qgis|d1910f59ddc14d1724c08191a1822237ace17c2c.

Files

transfo_test.zip	4.71 KB	2019-02-14	Jonas Hurst