QGIS Application - Bug report #21213
Pasting linestring into polygon layer does not produce polygon

2019-02-09 04:18 AM - Cory Albrecht

Status:	Closed			
Priority:	Normal			
Assignee:	Nyall Dawson			
Category:	Digitising			
Affected QGIS version:	3.4.4		**Regression?:**	No
Operating System:	Ubuntu 18.10		**Easy fix?:**	No
Pull Request or Patch supplied:	No		**Resolution:**	
Crashes QGIS or corrupts data:	No		**Copied to github as #:**	29031

Description

In 2.18.x and prior, if you copied a line that was a circle and then pasted it into a polygon layer, you would get a new polygon.

In 3.4 when you try that, it appears to add it to the polygon layer as still a linestring. In the attached image the pasted feature is the group of vertex crosses with no lines between them or filled colour.

If you try to save that to PostGIS the error message returned is: ERROR: 1 feature(s) not added - geometry type is not compatible with the current layer.

Associated revisions

Revision 71bdc319 - 2019-02-15 07:24 AM - Nyall Dawson

Fix pasting linestring into polygon layer should auto convert to polygon

(And polygon->lines, lines->points, polygon->points, etc)

Fixes #21213

Revision 43405182 - 2019-03-07 03:02 AM - Nyall Dawson

Fix pasting linestring into polygon layer should auto convert to polygon

(And polygon->lines, lines->points, polygon->points, etc)

Fixes #21213

(cherry picked from commit 71bdc3192df71aa6a5ca437ff435bd94557a85d6)

History

#1 - 2019-02-11 06:39 PM - Giovanni Manghi

- Status changed from Open to Feedback

- Priority changed from High to Normal

- Category changed from Editing to Digitising

I'm not sure that in 2.* the behavior you describe was implemented by design, actually I'm a bit surprised it worked and not surprised it does not work on QGIS 3. This should be asked/clarified in the developers mailing list.

#2 - 2019-02-12 09:50 PM - Cory Albrecht

Giovanni Manghi wrote:

> I'm not sure that in 2.* the behavior you describe was implemented by design, actually I'm a bit surprised it worked and not surprised it does not
> work on QGIS 3. This should be asked/clarified in the developers mailing list.

The 2.18 docs recommend it so it appears to be there by design.
https://docs.qgis.org/2.18/en/docs/user_manual/working_with_vector/editing_geometry_attributes.html#cutting-copying-and-pasting-features

-=-=
Transform polygon into line and vice-versa using copy/paste

Copy a line feature and paste it in a polygon layer: QGIS pastes in the target layer a polygon whose boundary corresponds to the closed geometry of the
line feature. This is a quick way to generate different geometries of the same data.
-=-=

#3 - 2019-02-12 09:52 PM - Giovanni Manghi

Cory Albrecht wrote:

> Giovanni Manghi wrote:
>
>> I'm not sure that in 2.* the behavior you describe was implemented by design, actually I'm a bit surprised it worked and not surprised it does not
>> work on QGIS 3. This should be asked/clarified in the developers mailing list.
>
> The 2.18 docs recommend it.
> https://docs.qgis.org/2.18/en/docs/user_manual/working_with_vector/editing_geometry_attributes.html#cutting-copying-and-pasting-features

ok cool, is not the first or the last qgis feature I didn't knew it existed. But anyway we should ask if this was **removed** by design in QGIS3 (as the digitizing
code changes quite a lot).

#4 - 2019-02-12 10:05 PM - Cory Albrecht

Giovanni Manghi wrote:

> ok cool, is not the first or the last qgis feature I didn't knew it existed. But anyway we should ask if this was **removed** by design in QGIS3 (as the
> digitizing code changes quite a lot).

I hope it wasn't removed by design as I rely on it. I frequently have need to copy dozens of islands from coastline data which is linestrings to be able to
paste into the polygon layer and merge with the mainland feature that I drew.

#5 - 2019-02-13 10:54 PM - Nyall Dawson
- Status changed from Feedback to In Progress
- Assignee set to Nyall Dawson

#6 - 2019-02-15 07:24 AM - Nyall Dawson

- Status changed from In Progress to Closed

- % Done changed from 0 to 100

Applied in changeset commit:qgis|71bdc3192df71aa6a5ca437ff435bd94557a85d6.

#7 - 2019-03-03 06:51 PM - Cory Albrecht

Appears fixed in 3.7 but not in 3.6.0 or 3.4.5

#8 - 2019-03-04 11:50 PM - Nyall Dawson

Cory - I've just backported to 3.4. But the fix **is** in 3.6.0 final.

#9 - 2019-03-10 07:34 PM - Cory Albrecht

Nyall Dawson wrote:

> *Cory - I've just backported to 3.4. But the fix **is** in 3.6.0 final.*

Works in 3.6.0, haven't tried 3.4.5 or 3.7 yet.

Files

Screenshot from 2019-02-08 22-16-04.png	689 KB	2019-02-09	Cory Albrecht