

QGIS Application - Bug report #20760

Edits in GeoJson datasources are not saved anymore

2018-12-09 11:08 PM - Ehsan Aliverdi

Status:	Open	
Priority:	High	
Assignee:		
Category:	Data Provider	
Affected QGIS version:	3.4.4	Regression?: Yes
Operating System:	Windows	Easy fix?: No
Pull Request or Patch supplied:	No	Resolution:
Crashes QGIS or corrupts data:	No	Copied to github as #: 28580
Description		
<p>I tested this issue in Qgis 3.4.0, 3.4.1, 3.4.2 in all the same issue</p> <p>in our company we work with Geojson files in Qgis. When editing the attributes of an existing feature in Geojson layer, QGIS creates a temp layer and applies the changes on that new temp layer and never applies the changes on original layer.</p> <p>this problem wasn't there in version 3.2.3</p>		

History

#1 - 2018-12-10 10:05 AM - Giovanni Manghi

- Subject changed from QGIS does not update GeoJson Files after creation to Edits in GeoJson datasources are not saved anymore
- Category changed from Attribute table to Data Provider
- Affected QGIS version changed from 3.4.0 to 3.4.2
- Operating System deleted (Windows 10)
- Crashes QGIS or corrupts data changed from Yes to No

#2 - 2018-12-17 12:05 PM - Ben Hur Pintor

Hi Ehsan,

Can you provide a sample dataset to test this? I just tested editing a GeoJSON layer on 3.4.2 (Ubuntu 18.04) and everything works as expected. I can edit the fields and even add/delete fields. No temp layer is created and the original layer is edited.

Thanks!

Sincerely,
Ben Hur

#3 - 2018-12-17 11:40 PM - Ehsan Aliverdi

- File 2018-12-18_9-15-07.png added
- File equipment.geojson added

Ben Hur Pintor wrote:

Hi Ehsan,

Can you provide a sample dataset to test this? I just tested editing a GeoJSON layer on 3.4.2 (Ubuntu 18.04) and everything works as expected. I can edit the fields and even add/delete fields. No temp layer is created and the original layer is edited.

Thanks!

*Sincerely,
Ben Hur*

Hi Ben

Thanks for reply

Please find a sample dataset enclosed. I have tested this in more than 10 different pc with windows. I just did another test with the following qgis(see the image enclosed)

step to reproduce the issue:

- Put equipment layer on editable mode
- use identify tool to id a feature(anyone will work)
- use edit feature form to edit an attribute of a feature
- save the changes
- toggle edit
- use identify tool to id the feature.

You will see nothing is changed.

Kindly Regards

Ehsan

#4 - 2018-12-18 01:36 PM - Ben Hur Pintor

- File edit-geojson.gif added

Ehsan Aliverdi wrote:

Hi Ben

Thanks for reply

Please find a sample dataset enclosed. I have tested this in more than 10 different pc with windows. I just did another test with the following qgis(see the image enclosed)

step to reproduce the issue:

- Put equipment layer on editable mode*
- use identify tool to id a feature(anyone will work)*
- use edit feature form to edit an attribute of a feature*
- save the changes*
- toggle edit*
- use identify tool to id the feature.*

You will see nothing is changed.

Kindly Regards

Ehsan

Hi Ehsan,

For my setup (QGIS 3.4.2 on Ubuntu 18.04), I could edit the attributes of the GeoJSON. Kindly check the GIF attached if I followed your instructions to reproduce the bug. Maybe this is a Windows-specific problem. If possible, could you also send a video or GIF of the bug in action.

Thank you.

Sincerely,
Ben Hur

#5 - 2018-12-20 06:01 AM - Ehsan Aliverdi

- File *geoJsonProblem.gif* added

Ben Hur Pintor wrote:

Ehsan Aliverdi wrote:

Hi Ben

Thanks for reply

Please find a sample dataset enclosed. I have tested this in more than 10 different pc with windows. I just did another test with the following qgis(see the image enclosed)

step to reproduce the issue:

-Put equipment layer on editable mode

-use identify tool to id a feature(anyone will work)

-use edit feature form to edit an attribute of a feature

-save the changes

-toggle edit

-use identify tool to id the feature.

You will see nothing is changed.

Kindly Regards

Ehsan

Hi Ehsan,

For my setup (QGIS 3.4.2 on Ubuntu 18.04), I could edit the attributes of the GeoJSON. Kindly check the GIF attached if I followed your instructions to reproduce the bug. Maybe this is a Windows-specific problem. If possible, could you also send a video or GIF of the bug in action.

Thank you.

Sincerely,

Ben Hur

Thanks alot for your reply. I am using windows. for your information I attached a gif file which shows the problem. we use qgis on 20 PCs in our company and all have the same issue because of this issue we downgraded every qgis to 2.3.2 which works perfect.

Regards

Ehsan

#6 - 2019-02-15 02:10 PM - Paul Blottiere

FWIW, I didn't succeed in reproducing the issue either.

#7 - 2019-02-16 10:37 AM - Giovanni Manghi

- Affected QGIS version changed from 3.4.2 to 3.4.4

Paul Blottiere wrote:

| *FWIW, I didn't succeed in reproducing the issue either.*

I can **easily** replicate on 3.4.4 (following the steps in the attached cast) on Windows (clean install of both QGIS and the OS).

#8 - 2019-02-18 09:13 AM - Paul Blottiere

- Operating System set to Windows

Hi @Giovanni,

| *I can easily replicate on 3.4.4 (following the steps in the attached cast) on Windows (clean install of both QGIS and the OS).*

OK, so according to @Ben Hur comment and my own tests on Debian, it seems that it's pretty specific to Windows.

#9 - 2019-02-21 01:01 PM - Peter Petrik

unable to replicate on MacOS too. So definitely windows-only issue.

#10 - 2019-02-26 12:50 PM - Adam Liddell

Also replicated this bug on 3.6.0 with Windows 7. The edits are written to a *.geojson.tmp file, but never copied over the top of the *.geojson file.

#11 - 2019-02-26 02:16 PM - Adam Liddell

Assuming this is the driver used for GeoJSON, could this be the offending section in GDAL OGR:

https://github.com/OSGeo/gdal/blob/ab9e80368ef662712c963191fd86fde2c5b75600/gdal/ogr/ogrsf_frmts/geojson/ogrgeojsondatasource.cpp#L1056-L098

Here's the steps it's taking:

1. The new *.geojson.tmp file containing the changes is written
2. The *.geojson is moved to *.geojson.bak
3. The *.geojson.tmp file is renamed to *.geojson
4. The *.geojson.bak file is removed

On Windows, this appears to be failing in step 2, as the tmp file is created but the bak file is not. Perhaps this is due to how Windows does file locking, meaning the rename is prohibited as the file appears to be open? Unfortunately I can't seem to get the log output from this section of code, so I don't see 'Cannot create backup copy' anywhere.

#12 - 2019-04-21 03:24 PM - Amine Aboufirass

Has there been any progress on this? I also submitted a similar question on stackexchange...

<https://gis.stackexchange.com/questions/319450/qgis-values-in-attribute-table-become-null-after-saving>

Pehaps there is a workaround?

#13 - 2019-04-22 01:34 PM - Evgeniy Lazarev

I asked Oct-31-2018 on stackexchange about this problem:
<https://gis.stackexchange.com/questions/300860/why-does-qgis-3-4-and-higher-create-tmp-file-instead-of-refresh-editing-layer-a> Since then I have to use 3.2.3 QGIS version.

#14 - 2019-04-24 09:54 PM - Edmond Lai

I am having the same issue with QGIS version 3.6.2-Noosa on Windows 10.

#15 - 2019-05-24 03:49 AM - louis de clebs

I am having the same issue on windows 7 (Unfortunately have to use windows at work).
Might also have something to do with line endings? When I commit a geojson file created by QGIS, git put a warning saying LF line ending in the geojson file are replaced by CRLF. Would it be something there <https://github.com/qgis/QGIS/blob/master/src/core/qgsvectorfilewriter.cpp#L1060> ?

- When adding a feature to the geojson file it is correctly handled
- When deleting or updating a feature the issue is happening

Only workaround at this stage is to save the file, close qgis, delete old geojson, rename new file by removing ".tmp" extension and re-open qgis... Or is there an easier way?

Files			
equipment.geojson	3.96 KB	2018-12-17	Ehsan Aliverdi
2018-12-18_9-15-07.png	30.5 KB	2018-12-17	Ehsan Aliverdi
edit-geojson.gif	386 KB	2018-12-18	Ben Hur Pintor
geoJsonProblem.gif	1.68 MB	2018-12-20	Ehsan Aliverdi