

QGIS Application - Bug report #20207

GeoPackage column misalignment after spatial join due to fid attribute

2018-10-24 01:21 PM - Andreas Wicht

Status:	Closed	
Priority:	High	
Assignee:	Luigi Pirelli	
Category:	Processing/Core	
Affected QGIS version:	3.2.3	Regression?: No
Operating System:	Ubuntu 18.04	Easy fix?: No
Pull Request or Patch supplied:	No	Resolution: wontfix
Crashes QGIS or corrupts data:	No	Copied to github as #: 28028
Description		
Issue might be related to: #19708		
Having a polygon layer in gpkg format and a point layer in *.shp format if you		
- join attributes by location (polygon attribute joined to points)		
- join all columns (that includes the fid column)		
- save result to gpkg		
Due to the fact that the result would contain 2 columns named "fid" one of them (the joined one) gets removed and the attributes misalign.		
At the moment the only ways to prevent this are:		
- select columns to join and exclude the fid column		
- prefix the joined columns		
If a user is not aware of this, this leads to data loss.		
If the above mentioned workarounds are not used, QGIS should automatically rename the joined "fid" column to "fid_2" or something along those lines.		

History

#1 - 2018-10-24 03:38 PM - Giovanni Manghi

- Status changed from Open to Feedback

do the original layers get changed in the process? if no then there is no data loss (not that a wrong result is better).

#2 - 2018-10-24 03:41 PM - Andreas Wicht

Giovanni Manghi wrote:

| do the original layers get changed in the process? if no then there is no data loss (not that a wrong result is better).

no, the original ones not, the loss is in the result. Sorry for misinterpreting the field. You can change it back to "no" then.

#3 - 2018-10-24 03:46 PM - Giovanni Manghi

- Crashes QGIS or corrupts data changed from Yes to No

- Operating System deleted (Windows 10 / Ubuntu 18.04)

- Status changed from Feedback to Open

#4 - 2018-11-08 12:13 PM - Jürgen Fischer

- Description updated

#5 - 2019-02-12 01:28 PM - Luigi Pirelli

- Assignee set to Luigi Pirelli

investigating

#6 - 2019-02-12 02:55 PM - Luigi Pirelli

- File Captura de pantalla de 2019-02-12 14-55-58.png added

the user is notified because choosing fid as PK (1,1,2,2,2) generate PK violation and record [1,3,4] are not added during save generating an error message as attached image (sorry it's in spanish because I was testing encoding errors)

#7 - 2019-02-12 03:47 PM - Luigi Pirelli

- Resolution set to wontfix

After verification with Giovanni Manghi we decided to close because the error message sent to the user is enough to understand the wrong use to "Save Vector Feature as" default parameters.
If the user leave fid as PK and the PK does not have unique values, the error is raised. It's responsibility to the user to understand the generated data and do not use PK that does not have unique values.

#8 - 2019-02-12 03:47 PM - Luigi Pirelli

- Status changed from Open to Closed

Files			
join_bug_pt.zip	1.17 KB	2018-10-24	Andreas Wicht
join_bug.gpkg	172 KB	2018-10-24	Andreas Wicht
Captura de pantalla de 2019-02-12 14-55-58.png	46.3 KB	2019-02-12	Luigi Pirelli