

QGIS Application - Bug report #19931

The "iterate over this layer" button is missing for the "Extract selected features" algorithm input layer

2018-09-24 03:05 PM - Harrissou Santanna

Status:	Rejected	
Priority:	High	
Assignee:	Nyall Dawson	
Category:	Processing/QGIS	
Affected QGIS version:	3.3(master)	Regression?: Yes
Operating System:		Easy fix?: No
Pull Request or Patch supplied:		Resolution: invalid
Crashes QGIS or corrupts data:		Copied to github as #: 27754
Description		
<p>The other "extract by ..." algorithms seem to have the green button to iterate over the layer; not that one.</p> <p>Set as regression because the "save selected features" in 2.18 has the button.</p>		

History

#1 - 2018-09-25 09:44 AM - Giovanni Manghi

- Priority changed from Normal to High

#2 - 2018-10-01 06:25 AM - Nyall Dawson

- Status changed from Open to In Progress

- Assignee set to Nyall Dawson

#3 - 2018-10-01 06:41 AM - Nyall Dawson

- Status changed from In Progress to Rejected

- Resolution set to invalid

I've looked into this -- while the button exists in 2.18, it has absolutely no meaning. In iterating mode a temporary layer is created for each feature in the selected layers, and this temporary layer has no selection in it! So running in 2.18 always results in the incorrect error message: "There are no selected features in the input layer."

I think the 3.x behavior is preferable here, and we should continue to hide the button.

#4 - 2018-10-01 06:58 AM - Harrissou Santanna

I'm not sure I understand: in 2.18, the tool would be buggy so it should not be ported and fixed in 3.x?

The question was raised in a french forum by someone who wanted to select features in a layer (no particular rule of selection) and output each to geojson. What would then be the appropriate and quick way to do this in 3.x?

#5 - 2018-10-01 07:10 AM - Nyall Dawson

Well, making it working is non-trivial, to say the least. I can "fix" it and re-add the button, but it'll continue to be useless/misleading/a cause of user frustration.

Truth is - there's no regression here. Outputting selected features to individual layers isn't any more difficult in 3.x than 2.x. I think the easiest way to do this

would be as a two step approach by first saving/copying the selected features to a new layer, and then iterating over that layer.