QGIS Application - Bug report #19708
Processing: Join attributes by location produces duplicated fid

2018-08-27 03:33 PM - Jérôme Guélat

Status:	Closed			
Priority:	Normal			
Assignee:				
Category:	Processing/QGIS			
Affected QGIS version:	3.2.2	**Regression?:**	No	
Operating System:		**Easy fix?:**	No	
Pull Request or Patch supplied:		**Resolution:**		
Crashes QGIS or corrupts data:		**Copied to github as #:**	27533	

Description

Here's how to reproduce the bug:

1. Add the 2 layers (pol1 and pol2) from the attached GeoPackage
2. In Processing, open Join attributes by location
3. Input layer: pol1; join layer: pol2; geometric predicate: within
4. Don't specify an output file (use a temporary layer)
5. The resulting layer will have 2 features with the same fid, and hence can't be saved to a new GeoPackage without manually editing the fid values
6. If you save directly to a GeoPackage (instead of using a temporary layer), one feature will be lost. Suprisingly, this doesn't happen if you save directly to a Shapefile

I know it is uncommon to use a spatial join with perfectly overlapping geometries in the joined layer, but it would be nice to have a consistent behaviour between different output formats.

Related issues:

Related to QGIS Application - Bug report # 19758: Processing: merge vector la...	**Open**	**2018-09-03**
Related to QGIS Application - Bug report # 19998: Cannot export output of 'Po...	**Closed**	**2018-10-02**

Associated revisions

Revision f8d873c7 - 2018-10-31 10:27 AM - Matthias Kuhn

Regenerate fids for "join attributes by location"

Fix #19708

Revision 1d474d8e - 2018-10-31 01:48 PM - Matthias Kuhn

Regenerate fids for "join attributes by location"

Fix #19708

History

#1 - 2018-08-27 04:07 PM - Jérôme Guélat

Note that something similar happens with the Intersection algorithm (and maybe with other algorithms based on overlays).

#2 - 2018-08-30 01:43 AM - Giovanni Manghi

- Operating System deleted (Windows 7)

Confirmed here. I think that especially the result of the operation 6 ("If you save directly to a GeoPackage (instead of using a temporary layer), one feature will be lost") is particularly problematic.

#3 - 2018-09-17 10:20 AM - Jérôme Guélat

After further testing, this also applies when the geometries are not perfectly overlapping (use intersect instead of within as a geometric predicate)... The problem happens when one feature from the input layer has at least 2 intersecting features in the join layer (and we perform a one-to-many spatial join).

See also #19758

#4 - 2018-10-08 12:47 PM - Andrea Giudiceandrea

- Related to Bug report #19758: Processing: merge vector layers produces duplicated fid added

#5 - 2018-10-08 12:47 PM - Andrea Giudiceandrea

- Related to Bug report #19998: Cannot export output of 'Points along geometry' tool as Geopackage added

#6 - 2018-10-31 09:15 AM - Matthias Kuhn

- Status changed from Open to In Progress

https://github.com/qgis/QGIS/pull/8240

#7 - 2018-10-31 01:46 PM - Anonymous

- % Done changed from 0 to 100

- Status changed from In Progress to Closed

Applied in changeset commit:qgis|f8d873c7cb44adada2ab38a5f1dad6a96adf8e14.

Files

testgeom.gpkg		136 KB	2018-08-27	Jérôme Guélat