QGIS Application - Bug report #17124
Editing behavior of filtered layers is inconsistent

2017-09-12 09:29 AM - Giovanni Manghi

Status:	Open		
Priority:	High		
Assignee:			
Category:	Vectors		
Affected QGIS version:	3.2.2	**Regression?:**	Yes
Operating System:		**Easy fix?:**	No
Pull Request or Patch supplied:	No	**Resolution:**	
Crashes QGIS or corrupts data:	No	**Copied to github as #:**	25023

Description

Seen on 2.14, 2.18 and master.

Add a shapefile
Set a filter > vector continues editable
Save project, close project and reopen it > layer is not editable
Clear filter > still not editable
Save project, close project and reopen it > layer editable

Related issues:

Related to QGIS Application - Bug report # 17245: "orig_ogc_fid" field is add...	**Feedback**	**2017-10-04**
Related to QGIS Application - Bug report # 19699: Removing Filter on shape fi...	**Closed**	**2018-08-26**
Duplicated by QGIS Application - Bug report # 17193: Editing of shapefile loc...	**Closed**	**2017-09-25**

History

#1 - 2017-09-28 09:28 AM - Jürgen Fischer

- Duplicated by Bug report #17193: Editing of shapefile locked following clearing of a filter added

#2 - 2017-10-03 09:50 AM - Jürgen Fischer

- Subject changed from Editing behaviur of filtered layers is inconsistent to Editing behavior of filtered layers is inconsistent

#3 - 2017-10-10 08:45 AM - Jürgen Fischer

- Related to Bug report #17245: "orig_ogc_fid" field is added to filtered shapefiles in QGIS master added

#4 - 2017-12-18 06:36 AM - Patrick Dunford

This is a big deal for me, because when I have to close the project just so I can edit a table that I had a filter applied to (after removing the filter) and then reopen the project again.

However I think there is a whole question here of why editing a filtered table is blocked. In my maps which are used to show generations of historical data, there can be overlapping features that you want to hide to be able to draw in different generation ones. At the moment I have to create them in a separate table then paste them. Now imagine that I need to edit, then having to make another copy of the data to make changes to it, and then paste back.

Here is a need for a paradigm shift for working with a filtered table. When a filter is created on a layer, the GUI should create a temporary copy of the table, apply the filter to it and use that copy for the displaying of data. But allowing the user to edit the real table. Or something like that.

#5 - 2018-01-25 03:22 PM - Giovanni Manghi

- Regression? changed from No to Yes
- Priority changed from Normal to High

- Affected QGIS version changed from 2.18.12 to 2.18.16

#6 - 2018-02-28 08:42 AM - Patrick Dunford

I'm curious about all this because in 2.14 I can follow these steps

- Put a filter onto a table
- Put the table into edit mode
- Add a new feature or change an existing one
- Save the layer
- Take the layer out of edit mode
- Remove the filter

  without apparently any repercussions.

The layer type is a shapefile.
In view of the additional restrictions being applied in 2.18 and later maybe there are some questions that could be answered in another forum? Maybe they already have.

1. What is the technical reason for the limitation being desirable
2. Is there a technical reason for the change being necessary after 2.14 but not an issue in 2.14
3. Is there a different file based layer type that does not require these limitations.

TIA

#7 - 2018-02-28 11:18 AM - Giovanni Manghi

- Affected QGIS version changed from 2.18.16 to 2.18.17
- Status changed from Open to Feedback

> *The layer type is a shapefile.*
> *In view of the additional restrictions being applied in 2.18 and later maybe there are some questions that could be answered in another forum? Maybe they already have. 1. What is the technical reason for the limitation being desirable*
> *2. Is there a technical reason for the change being necessary after 2.14 but not an issue in 2.14*
> *3. Is there a different file based layer type that does not require these limitations.*

you have a better chance to have answers if you post your doubts in the users/developers mailing lists.

Anyway, the "normal" behavior is/was that filtered shapefiles/gpkgs/spatialite are not editable. This has always been the case in QGIS and as far I can see now is also the case on 2.18.16 and QGIS 3. Of course the fact that is possible to edit a filtered shapefiles/gpkgs/spatialite in QGIS 2.14(.22) raises questions.

This ticket can probably be closed as now the behavior is consistent (but the above question is of course very interesting).

#8 - 2018-03-01 10:22 AM - Antonio Viscomi

Patrick Dunford wrote:

> *I'm curious about all this because in 2.14 I can follow these steps*
> - *Put a filter onto a table*
> - *Put the table into edit mode*
> - *Add a new feature or change an existing one*
> - *Save the layer*
> - *Take the layer out of edit mode*
> - *Remove the filter*

> *without apparently any repercussions.*

Hi,
the filter I applied wasn in Properties --> query builder (not in attribute table) because I need to see only filtered records on the canvas;
the filter applied on attribute table works fine but don't filter the shapefile in the canvas then the issues is a little bit different...

> *The layer type is a shapefile.*
> *In view of the additional restrictions being applied in 2.18 and later maybe there are some questions that could be answered in another forum? Maybe they already have.*
> 1. *What is the technical reason for the limitation being desirable*
> 2. *Is there a technical reason for the change being necessary after 2.14 but not an issue in 2.14*
> 3. *Is there a different file based layer type that does not require these limitations.*
>
> *TIA*

#9 - 2018-03-01 10:40 AM - Giovanni Manghi

> *Hi,*
> *the filter I applied wasn in Properties --> query builder (not in attribute table) because I need to see only filtered records on the canvas;*
> *the filter applied on attribute table don't works fine but don't filter the shapefile in the canvas then the issues is a little bit different...*

I'm not sure I understand the above.
The filter in vector properties > query builder effectively will show you only filter records and features. The second part is not clear at all. I'm also not sure if the comment fits the issue described in this ticket.

#10 - 2018-03-01 04:11 PM - Antonio Viscomi

Giovanni Manghi wrote:

> *Hi,*
> *the filter I applied wasn in Properties --> query builder (not in attribute table) because I need to see only filtered records on the canvas;*
> *the filter applied on attribute table works fine but don't filter the shapefile in the canvas then the issues is a little bit different...*
>
> *I'm not sure I understand the above.*
> *The filter in vector properties > query builder effectively will show you only filter records and features. The second part is not clear at all. I'm also not sure if the comment fits the issue described in this ticket.*

The second part is referred only to the steps described in the first post by
Patrick Dunford, because It applied a filter onto attribute table, not on layers proprierties...

#11 - 2018-03-03 06:36 PM - Giovanni Manghi

- Status changed from Feedback to Open

> *The second part is referred only to the steps described in the first post by*
> *Patrick Dunford, because It applied a filter onto attribute table, not on layers proprierties...*

I still don't understand how this is related to the original description of this issue.

#12 - 2018-03-11 02:17 PM - Arjan Mossel

Giovanni Manghi wrote:

> *I still don't understand how this is related to the original description of this issue.*

I think I do. You said "This ticket can probably be closed as now the behavior is consistent", but it would be very useful for the behavior to be consistent the other way, with filtered layers always editable.

Because now it is not possible to have a filtered layer on the canvas and be able to edit its attributes. This is also what I'm looking for.

Edit: found #13292 for this.

#13 - 2018-08-29 05:01 PM - Giovanni Manghi

- Affected QGIS version changed from 2.18.17 to 3.2.2

See also #19699

#14 - 2018-08-29 07:29 PM - Jürgen Fischer

- Related to Bug report #19699: Removing Filter on shape file layer does not restore read-write permissions - editing refused until reload added

#15 - 2018-10-04 09:25 PM - Antonio Viscomi

In fact any change in snap tolerance setting don't solve the issues

#16 - 2018-10-04 10:43 PM - Giovanni Manghi

Antonio Viscomi wrote:

> *In fact any change in snap tolerance setting don't solve the issues*

this ticket isn't related at all to snapping.