

QGIS Application - Bug report #15793

Fill ring tool is broken

2016-10-31 10:28 AM - Luca Mandolesi

Status:	Closed	
Priority:	High	
Assignee:	Nyall Dawson	
Category:	Digitising	
Affected QGIS version:	3.5(master)	Regression?: Yes
Operating System:	Windows 10	Easy fix?: No
Pull Request or Patch supplied:	No	Resolution: invalid
Crashes QGIS or corrupts data:	No	Copied to github as #: 23713

Description

Qgis 2.18 32bit osgeo network installer Win 10.

If you have a polygon with a ring, when you use fill ring tool, you obtain a new geometry (as you expect) and a new part of the previous geometry.

Example:

in a shapefile

- 1 - add a polygon
- 2 - save it
- 3 - add a ring
- 4 - save
- 5 - fill it with fill ring

Result

- a new geometry added inside the shape of the ring
- a new "multipart" added without a correct shape

Also in spatialite the same, but it doesn't allow to save, and, if you discard the editing, the feature will be saved with a new unformed multipart.

If you try to delete the new multipart, all the geometry will be deleted.

History

#1 - 2016-10-31 10:29 AM - Luca Mandolesi

- File edifici.zip added

#2 - 2017-05-01 01:02 AM - Giovanni Manghi

- Easy fix? set to No

- Regression? set to No

#3 - 2019-01-24 10:09 AM - salvatore fiandaca

- Affected QGIS version changed from 2.18.0 to 3.5(master)

- Description updated

- Priority changed from Normal to High

- File bug.gif added

- Regression? changed from No to Yes

- Operating System set to Windows 10 64 bit

problem still present in 2.18.28, in 3.4.4 and in the master

it's a regression based on this link:

<https://gis.stackexchange.com/questions/89571/how-to-fill-in-a-ring-polygon-in-qgis-2-2>

#4 - 2019-01-26 11:50 AM - Giovanni Manghi

- Subject changed from *Fill ring unexpected result on polygonal layer - Qgis 2.18 - Win 10 to Fill ring tool is broken*
- Operating System deleted (*Windows 10 64 bit*)
- Category changed from *Vectors to Digitising*

#5 - 2019-01-29 12:38 AM - Nyall Dawson

- Assignee set to *Nyall Dawson*

#6 - 2019-01-29 01:08 AM - Nyall Dawson

- Status changed from *Open to Feedback*

I cannot reproduce. Can you attach a screencast showing the issue?

#7 - 2019-01-29 10:52 AM - Giovanni Manghi

- Status changed from *Feedback to Closed*
- Resolution set to *invalid*

I see where the misunderstanding come from:

the tool in QGIS was made to **open/create** a ring in a polygon and **automatically** fill it with a new polygon

BUT

the name "fill ring" makes users think they can fill an **existing** ring by digitizing a polygon around the ring --> this will cause the result as shown in the attached screencast.

Technically there is no bug BUT I agree that the tool name is at least misleading AND that actually a tool to fill **existing** rings (possibly with 1 click) should be added to the digitizing toolbar.

#8 - 2019-01-29 11:00 AM - Nyall Dawson

The tool already does this -- shift click an existing hole. Maybe it's just a documentation issue, or someone needs to read existing docs? ;)

#9 - 2019-01-29 11:43 AM - Jürgen Fischer

Nyall Dawson wrote:

| The tool already does this -- shift click an existing hole. Maybe it's just a documentation issue, or someone needs to read existing docs? ;)

see commit:e7744bdcd4708b3d61376ce9aab5ee6a8fe3656a

Jürgen Fischer wrote:

Nyall Dawson wrote:

The tool already does this -- shift click an existing hole. Maybe it's just a documentation issue, or someone needs to read existing docs? ;)

see commit:e7744bdcd4708b3d61376ce9aab5ee6a8fe3656a

shame on me, I missed the functionality or maybe I just forgot about it.

Files			
edifici.zip	1.8 KB	2016-10-31	Luca Mandolesi
bug.gif	663 KB	2019-01-24	salvatore fiandaca