QGIS Application - Bug report #15086
Inconsistency between layernames in WMS and WFS

2016-06-20 05:30 AM - Mie Winstrup

Status:	Closed		
Priority:	Normal		
Assignee:			
Category:	QGIS Server		
Affected QGIS version:	2.14.0	**Regression?:**	No
Operating System:	Ubuntu	**Easy fix?:**	No
Pull Request or Patch supplied:		**Resolution:**	
Crashes QGIS or corrupts data:		**Copied to github as #:**	23028

Description

There is inconsistency between WMS and WFS layer names when calling a layer with a space in the name. This makes it difficult programmatically to use a combination of WMS and WFS.

Case:
I have a qgis-project which contains a layer with a space in the name, e.g. 'Skov fra fot'. The qgis-project is published as a WMS and WFS with QGIS Server (ubuntu).

In the WMS GetCapabilities-call, the name contains the space:

WMS_call.png

However in the WFS GetCapabilities-call, the space is replaced with '_' in the name.

WFS_call.png

According to the WFS-specification, the name needs to be a QName which does not allow spaces (https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/QName). However, it seems there is no name-restriction in the WMS-specification.

Idea for solutions 1:
To ease programming, it would be good if the WMS and WFS followed the same rule when a layer contained a space (and other special characters). Since the WFS specification does not allow spaces, the same rule could be applied to the WMS. However, this will impact existing services.

Idea for solution 2:
If Idea 1 is not durable, then it should be possible to use the setting 'Use layer ids as names'. This works on WMS but not on WFS - where the layername is not changed to layerid (see #15085)
WFS_use_layernames_as_ids_001.png

Related issues:

Related to QGIS Application - Bug report # 15085: The setting 'Use layer ids ...	**Closed**	**2016-06-20**

History

#1 - 2016-06-20 05:31 AM - Mie Winstrup

- File WFS_call.png added

- File WMS_call.png added

- File WMS_use_layernames_as_ids.png added

- File WFS_use_layernames_as_ids_001.png added

#2 - 2016-06-20 06:14 AM - Jukka Rahkonen

For comparison I add some links to an implementation proposal and the discussion that followed in the Geoserver project:

https://github.com/geoserver/geoserver/wiki/GSIP-127

http://osgeo-org.1560.x6.nabble.com/Regression-in-2-7-x-valid-coverage-names-are-rejected-because-not-valid-xml-names-tt5183102.html

I believe that the best that can be done would be to inform user: This layer name is invalid as a WFS typename, reason:[] Do you want to:

a) Rename the the layer so that it is valid for both WMS and WFS

b) Keep the name for WMS and let QGIS to convert the name into valid typename for WFS

#3 - 2016-07-06 07:23 AM - Mie Winstrup

Jukka Rahkonen wrote:

> *For comparison I add some links to an implementation proposal and the discussion that followed in the Geoserver project:*
>
> *https://github.com/geoserver/geoserver/wiki/GSIP-127*
>
> *http://osgeo-org.1560.x6.nabble.com/Regression-in-2-7-x-valid-coverage-names-are-rejected-because-not-valid-xml-names-tt5183102.html*
>
> *I believe that the best that can be done would be to inform user: This layer name is invalid as a WFS typename, reason:[] Do you want to:*
>
> *a) Rename the the layer so that it is valid for both WMS and WFS*
>
> *b) Keep the name for WMS and let QGIS to convert the name into valid typename for WFS*

Maybe it would be best if QGIS convert spaces in names to '_' for WMS, since the WFS specification does not allow spaces?

#4 - 2017-05-01 01:05 AM - Giovanni Manghi

- Regression? set to No

- Easy fix? set to No

#5 - 2017-10-20 10:20 AM - René-Luc ReLuc

- Description updated

The layer name in WFS has to be compatible with an XML element tag name. It is not only used in URL has apram, it is also used to defined the Feature XML element tag name.

#6 - 2017-10-20 10:21 AM - René-Luc ReLuc

Used the shortname to avoid this difference.

#7 - 2017-10-20 10:23 AM - Giovanni Manghi

- Status changed from Open to Closed

René-Luc ReLuc wrote:

> *Used the shortname to avoid this difference.*

so this can be closed?

Files

WFS_call.png	116 KB	2016-06-20	Mie Winstrup
WMS_call.png	188 KB	2016-06-20	Mie Winstrup
WMS_use_layernames_as_ids.png	170 KB	2016-06-20	Mie Winstrup
WFS_use_layernames_as_ids_001.png	142 KB	2016-06-20	Mie Winstrup