

QGIS Application - Bug report #13661

Node tool should not allow to delete nodes and leave just 1 in lines or two in polygons

2015-10-23 07:31 AM - Peter Drexel

Status:	Closed	
Priority:	High	
Assignee:		
Category:	Digitising	
Affected QGIS version:	master	Regression?: No
Operating System:		Easy fix?: No
Pull Request or Patch supplied:		Resolution: fixed/implemented
Crashes QGIS or corrupts data:		Copied to github as #: 21696
Description When I am editing a Feature in a Line-Shapefile I can delete all but one nodes of a Line leading to a Line Feature with just one single Point. I think, when Editing Lines with the Node Tool it should not be possible to delete the 2. Last Node of a Line. It is BTW the same Situation editing Polygons. By deleting all but 2 nodes I can create a polygon with 2 to points... Peter		
Related issues: Related to QGIS Application - Bug report # 13099: [regression] nodetool cannot... Closed 2015-07-09 Related to QGIS Application - Bug report # 13674: Crash when deleting feature... Closed 2015-10-26		

History

#1 - 2015-10-25 01:45 AM - Saber Razmjooei

- Category changed from Vectors to Digitising

#2 - 2015-11-07 10:14 AM - Giovanni Manghi

- Subject changed from Shapefile Editing to Node tool should not allow to delete nodes and leave just 1 in lines or two in polygons
- Operating System deleted (Windows 7)
- OS version deleted (64 bit)

by the way, with polygons is possible to save one with just two nodes (after deleting the others with the node tool), creating polygon with area = 0.

#3 - 2015-11-08 03:19 AM - Jürgen Fischer

Duplicate of #13099?

#4 - 2015-11-08 12:30 PM - Nyal Dawson

I think the correct behaviour should still be to allow <3 nodes in polygons and 1 nodes for lines as a temporary step (see #13099 for reasoning), but then catch these invalid geometries when node tool operation is finalised for the feature.

#5 - 2015-11-10 02:53 AM - Giovanni Manghi

Nyal Dawson wrote:

I think the correct behaviour should still be to allow <3 nodes in polygons and 1 nodes for lines as a temporary step (see #13099 for reasoning), but

then catch these invalid geometries when node tool operation is finalised for the feature.

Hi Nyall, I see your point, but anyway as it is right now in master is a bit confusing. Take the polygon example: the user deletes all but two nodes, as soon as the focus of the node tool switches to another polygon, the two noded one disappear... but after saving edits it re-appear (as a "line"). Cheers!

#6 - 2015-11-10 03:09 AM - Jürgen Fischer

Giovanni Manghi wrote:

Hi Nyall, I see your point, but anyway as it is right now in master is a bit confusing. Take the polygon example: the user deletes all but two nodes, as soon as the focus of the node tool switches to another polygon, the two noded one disappear... but after saving edits it re-appear (as a "line"). Cheers!

Right, earlier removing the last point that would make a ring or line invalid (in terms of number of points) in the node tool would also remove the other remaining points.

#7 - 2015-11-10 03:13 AM - Nyall Dawson

Jürgen Fischer wrote:

Giovanni Manghi wrote:

Hi Nyall, I see your point, but anyway as it is right now in master is a bit confusing. Take the polygon example: the user deletes all but two nodes, as soon as the focus of the node tool switches to another polygon, the two noded one disappear... but after saving edits it re-appear (as a "line"). Cheers!

Right, earlier removing the last point that would make a ring or line invalid (in terms of number of points) in the node tool would also remove the other remaining points.

Ah ok - that makes a lot more sense.

#8 - 2015-11-10 03:24 AM - Saber Razmjooei

We also had a similiar discussion here #13674.

#9 - 2016-01-03 11:53 PM - Marco Hugentobler

<https://github.com/qgis/QGIS/pull/2632> provides a fix.

#10 - 2016-01-04 05:03 AM - Giovanni Manghi

- Resolution set to fixed/implemented
- Status changed from Open to Closed