

QGIS Application - Bug report #10815

refine rules (add ranges/categories): expressions not applied/written correctly

2014-07-05 03:40 AM - baditaflorin -

Status: Closed	
Priority: Normal	
Assignee: Nyall Dawson	
Category: Symbology	
Affected QGIS version: master	Regression?: No
Operating System:	Easy fix?: No
Pull Request or Patch applied: No	Resolution:
Crashes QGIS or corrupts data: No	Copied to github as #: 19191
Description	
new description:	
#10815-7	
old description:	
Expected result . To filter only the numbers on the pntcnt that are higher then 4802	
"pntcnt" > 4802	
Instead i get only 5 values, from	
0-0.2	
0.2-0.4	
0.4-0.6	
0.6-0.8	
0.8-1	
Related issues:	
Duplicates QGIS Application - Feature request # 10479: Refine current rule	Open 2014-06-05

Associated revisions

Revision ae853766 - 2015-10-12 12:01 PM - Nyall Dawson

Fix refining rule based renderer using expression (fix #10815)

History

#1 - 2014-07-05 03:43 AM - Nathan Woodrow

That isn't doing what you expected it to. What you are doing there is making a range based on the results from the expression "pntcnt" > 4802 which is from 0 -> 1.

What you are looking for isn't implemented yet.

#2 - 2014-07-05 03:44 AM - Nathan Woodrow

- Resolution set to duplicate

- Status changed from Open to Closed

#10479

#3 - 2014-07-05 03:57 AM - baditaflorin -

Yes it is implemented, i discovered it now

```
CASE WHEN "pntcnt" <50 THEN "pntcnt" END
```

Thanks for the quick reply

#4 - 2014-07-05 04:50 AM - baditaflorin -

- File *strange.jpg* added

- Status changed from Closed to Reopened

This is strange, doing a query like this works

```
CASE WHEN ( "pntcnt" <100.1 ) THEN "pntcnt" END
```

But searching for bigger numbers not working

```
CASE WHEN ( "pntcnt" >100.1 ) THEN "pntcnt" END
```

Or if i search only for 200, i get all the values until 200, as seen in the photo

In this sense you say that is not implemented, that it works only with < ?

#5 - 2014-07-05 05:23 AM - baditaflorin -

- File *refine_by_categories.jpg* added

If i choose refine by category, then the CASE ELSE is working, even with

```
CASE WHEN "pntcnt" >= 50.1000 AND "pntcnt" <= 100.1 THEN "pntcnt" END
```

As can be seen in the photo

#6 - 2014-07-05 02:02 PM - Jürgen Fischer

- Category set to *Symbology*

#7 - 2014-07-07 08:42 AM - Giovanni Manghi

- Status changed from Reopened to Feedback

- Resolution deleted (duplicate)

- OS version deleted (7)

- Operating System deleted (Windows)

- Subject changed from *refine a rule to rules - colums filter not working to refine rules (add ranges/categories): expressions not applied/written correctly*

This is what I see (please correct me if I'm wrong):

categorized renderer

- in the normal categorized renderer I can use an expression like (NUMPOINTS is a integer field)

```
CASE WHEN "NUMPOINTS" >= 50.0000 AND "NUMPOINTS" <= 100.0 THEN "NUMPOINTS" END
```

this will effectively create a subset of values and for each of them it will create a separate symbology class

- in the **rule based renderer** when I refine a rule (by category), the same expression will result in a filter like (example for just one symbology class)

```
"CASE WHEN ""NUMPOINTS"" >= 50.0000 AND ""NUMPOINTS"" <= 100.0 THEN ""NUMPOINTS"" END" = 68.0000
```

and this is wrong, in fact if I remove the not necessary "" the expression works

```
CASE WHEN "NUMPOINTS" >= 50.0000 AND "NUMPOINTS" <= 100.0 THEN "NUMPOINTS" END = 68.0000
```

(and otherwise testing the filter/expression fails with "Column 'CASE WHEN "NUMPOINTS" >= 50.0000 AND "NUMPOINTS" <= 100.0 THEN "NUMPOINTS" END' not found")

- in a similar fashion an expression like

```
"NUMPOINTS" > 100
```

will return 1 or 0 (depending if is true or not that the feature has more than 100 "NUMPOINTS").

This will work ok in the standard categorized renderer but in the rule based one, when refining by category it will result in rules with too many "", example

```
"CASE WHEN ""NUMPOINTS"" >= 50.0000 AND ""NUMPOINTS"" <= 100.0 THEN ""NUMPOINTS"" END" = 59.0000
```

Similar observations can be done for **graduated renderer**:

- in the standard graduated renderer an expression like

```
CASE WHEN "NUMPOINTS" >= 50.0000 AND "NUMPOINTS" <= 100.0 THEN "NUMPOINTS" END
```

can be used to effectively render (by ranges) only the features with "NUMPOINTS" between 50 and 100

- when the same expression is used to refine a rule based rule by adding a range then is written wrong (example, for one symbology class):

```
"CASE WHEN ""NUMPOINTS"" >= 50.0000 AND ""NUMPOINTS"" <= 100.0 THEN ""NUMPOINTS"" END" >= 84.0000 AND "CASE WHEN ""NUMPOINTS"" >= 50.0000 AND ""NUMPOINTS"" <= 100.0 THEN ""NUMPOINTS"" END" <= 97.0000
```

- similar observation for an expression like

```
"NUMPOINTS" > 100
```

This does not seem to work on 2.2 either, where the expressions were introduced to allow more advanced categorized/graduated symbology, then it should be tagged as blocker, because is a new feature that does not work as expected (at least inside the rule based symbology).

#8 - 2015-05-22 12:34 AM - Giovanni Manghi

- Affected QGIS version changed from 2.4.0 to master
- Status changed from Feedback to Open

#9 - 2015-09-16 02:30 AM - Vladimir Udilov

- File refine_bug.png added

I can reproduce this bug in 2.10.1.

Basically when you refine a rule (adding range or category both) using an expression instead of just a field, left parts of sub-rules that are created are escaped as if they were a field name. See attached screenshot - double quotes inside expression and unneeded quotes around expression can be seen. Escaping was probably added when fixing this bug: Issue #5536

#10 - 2015-10-10 11:26 PM - Nyall Dawson

Some more detail in #13561

#11 - 2015-10-12 12:36 AM - Nyall Dawson

- Assignee set to Nyall Dawson

#12 - 2015-10-12 03:01 AM - Nyall Dawson

- Status changed from Open to Closed

Fixed in changeset commit:"ae85376614f27da2d3f4b389e26539709a1be5e0".

#13 - 2017-08-08 12:56 AM - Jürgen Fischer

- Description updated

Files

refine_a_rule_to_ranges_not_working.jpg	31.2 KB	2014-07-05	baditaflorin -
strange.jpg	43.4 KB	2014-07-05	baditaflorin -
refine_by_categories.jpg	66.8 KB	2014-07-05	baditaflorin -
refine_bug.png	47.7 KB	2015-09-16	Vladimir Udilov